



The International Privacy Law Library

Graham Greenleaf

Professor of Law & Information Systems, UNSW

Co-Director, AustLII

AustLII Research Seminar

28 November 2014

Objective: Making LII content more useful to privacy authorities & others

- (Demand) Data Protection Authorities (DPAs) & Privacy Enforcement Agencies (PEAs)
 - Increasing desire to cooperate (eg GPEN)
 - Lack knowledge of each other's laws & decisions
 - Interest in consistency of reasoning and penalties
- (Supply) LIIs cooperating in WorldLII
 - Have significant data that DPAs/PEAs can use
 - Could add more to develop a global 'Library'
 - Can this be done at a low & sustainable cost?

Issues requiring answers in any 'Library-building' exercise

1. What DPA/PEA decisions + laws are available?
2. How can existing LII content on privacy be isolated?
3. How can a Library be made sustainable at low cost?
4. What subject expertise (privacy) is needed?
5. Can materials in many languages be made useful?
6. How can users (DPA/PEA + others) be engaged?

Using available LII content

- LIIs involved in WorldLII now hold 1600+ databases
 - 2M+ decisions; 100K+ journal articles; 80K+ treaties; ?M legislation items
- Recall of relevant items now gives many more documents
 - Precision often declines (ie more irrelevant items found)
 - LIIs are generic resources: cover all subject areas
 - Relevance ranking can't solve all problems
- How to reduce problems of (re-)gaining precision in research?
 - Commercial publishers respond with editorially-controlled subject collections, and with commentaries
 - LIIs can't afford constant editorial selection, nor commission commentary/doctrine
- Issue: How can LIIs create subject-oriented resources economically?
- Answer proposed: Pre-selection of LII content by method of an 'approximating search' + automated updating

Two types of Library content

1. Specialist privacy-related databases

- Many DBs already on LIIs in WorldLII consortium
- Question of what key extra content is available

2. 'Virtual' databases from all LII content

- Created from 'expert searches' of all 1600+ databases
- Updated daily by repeating the same searches

(1) Availability of key *extra* content

- Decisions of DPAs/PEAs/appeal bodies
 - 90 countries have established DPAs
 - At least 50% publish decisions online
 - These can be reproduced: no ©, or consent
- 109 countries have data privacy legislation
 - All can be found and collected: 106/109 held
 - Most is added editorially to create databases
- International bodies' resources are available
 - EU, OECD, APEC, GPEN, CoE etc
- Some specialist 'law journals' are available

(2) Creating virtual DBs

1. All relevant specialist databases (DBs) **excluded** from search (already included in Library).
2. Editor (with subject expertise) develops **search** of remaining DBs which is comprehensive of subject.
3. Editor decides what **percentage** of results are sufficiently relevant for DB.
4. Concordance created of that % of results => **virtual database** for inclusion in Library.
5. Search re-run, with same % of results used for concordance, in **updates** of virtual DB (often daily).
6. Search, and % retained, are **tested** (subjectively and objectively) and **revised** periodically.

Result so far: WorldLII's International Privacy Law Library

- Currently 43 databases located on AustLII, NZLII, BAILII, HKLII & WorldLII
- Over 15,000 searchable items, including:
 - 26 databases containing 5,000 decisions of 16 DPAs & PEAs from 13 countries.
 - Databases of key documents of international data protection bodies (EU, APEC, DPA/PEA bodies)
 - 5 journals/commentary covering up to 20 years
 - Legislation & treaty databases (editorial selection) including legislation from most of the 106 countries
 - 5 virtual databases with over 8,000 items.

Usage and user engagement

- Rebuilding only started in January 2014
- Usage
 - No usage statistics for access *via* the Library
 - Access to materials *contained in* the Library:
 - Estimated total of over 1M accesses per year
 - About 22,000 p/a for Australian Federal DPA
 - About 150,000 p/a for EPIC Alert; 60,000 for PLBIR
- User engagement
 - GPEN teleconferences and demonstrations
 - Search facilities from GPEN and NZPCO websites

Conclusions and improvements

1. Sustainability is possible

- WorldLII policy to continue provision irrespective
- Most database will update automatically
- Minimal funding will result in expansion

2. New content to meet objectives is feasible

- Sets of decisions/authorisations from many other DPAs are potentially available
- Key legislation, journals etc can be expanded

3. Technical improvements to facilitate multi-lingual searching are possible

4. Another valuable form of LII cooperation

Documentation

- User guide to WorldLII's International Privacy Law Library (2 July 2014)
http://www.worldlii.org/int/special/privacy/user_guide_ipll.pdf
- G Greenleaf, P Chung and A Mowbray 'Affecting practices of data privacy authorities through a global online Library – *WorldLII's International Privacy Law Library*' at <http://ssrn.com/author=57970> (SSRN); submitted to *Computer Law & Security Review*